Preliminary Results of Field Emission Cathode Tests

James S. Sovey
NASA Glenn Research Center
and
Scott D. Kovaleski
QSS Group at
NASA Glenn Research Center
MS 301-3
21000 Brookpark Road
Cleveland, OH 44135
216-977-7454
James.Sovey@grc.nasa.gov

IEPC-01-280

Preliminary screening tests of field emission cathodes such as CVD diamond, textured pyrolytic graphite, and textured copper were conducted at background pressures typical of electric thruster test facilities to assess cathode performance and stability. Very low power electric thrusters which provide tens to hundreds microns of thrust may need field emission neutralizers that have a capability of tens to hundreds of microamperes. From current voltage characteristics, it was found that the CVD diamond and textured metals cathodes clearly satisfied the Fowler-Nordheim emission relation. The CVD diamond and a textured copper cathode had average current densities of 270 \( \mu \text{A/cm}^2 \) and 380 \( \mu \text{A/cm}^2 \), respectively, at the beginning-of-life. After a few hours of operation the cathode emission currents degraded by 40% to 75% at background pressures in the \( 10^{-5} \) Pa to \( 10^{-4} \) Pa range. The textured pyrolytic graphite had a modest current density at beginning-of-life of 84 \( \mu \text{A/cm}^2 \), but this cathode was the most stable of all. Extended testing of the most promising cathodes is warranted to determine if current degradation is a burn-in effect or whether it is a long-term degradation process. Preliminary experiments with ferroelectric emission cathodes, which are ceramics with spontaneous electric polarization, were conducted. Peak current densities of 30 mA/cm\(^2\) to 120 mA/cm\(^2\) were obtained for pulse durations of about 500 ns in the \( 10^{-4} \) Pa pressure range.

Introduction

Electric thrusters with input power levels from 1 W to about 100 W need electron emitters that require very low gas flow rates or no gas flow to perform their functions efficiently. In order to ensure that very low-power colloid thrusters, Field Emission Electric Propulsion (FEEP) devices, ion engines, Hall-effect thrusters, and gridded vacuum arc thrusters are reasonably attractive systems, a field-emission neutralizer is certainly desirable.[1-6] The Field Emission Cathode (FEC) is potential candidate to replace hollow cathodes and other thermionic emitters as cathodes for electric thrusters, spacecraft plasma contactors, and electrodynamic tether systems. FECs are generally comprised of two types, namely, the Spindt cathode which are cone-like structures and also coatings that have a negative electron affinity (NEA). The NEA coatings are usually carbon-based materials that might be doped with nitrogen, boron, hydrogen, or cesium. A recent review of the FEC technology as it
relates to electric thrusters and their basic requirements can be found in Reference 7. For example, the very low power FEEP and colloid thrusters which provide tens to hundreds micronewtons of thrust will require neutralizers that have a capability of tens to hundreds of microamperes. FECs have already demonstrated emission currents up to tens of mA/cm$^2$ in ultra-high vacuum environments.[7] Over the last few years researchers have been examining the Spindt type cathodes[8], diamond-film cathodes[9], and carbon nanotube cathodes[10] for electric propulsion applications. Although initial results sometimes look promising, operation of some of the FECs in traditional electric thruster test environments usually results in the degradation of emission current with time. Operation in test chambers with oxygen, nitrogen, water, or xenon at partial pressures of $10^{-5}$ to $10^{-6}$ Pa usually causes loss of performance over time.[8]

This paper reports on preliminary screening tests of FECs which use chemical vapor deposited (CVD) diamond, textured pyrolytic graphite, ion-beam textured copper, and untextured metals. The field emission properties of ferroelectric ceramics are also examined. Goals for the series of experiments include obtaining current densities greater than 10 mA/cm$^2$ with electric fields less than 25 V/µm. FECs with this emission current capability would satisfy requirements for electric thrusters operating at many tens of watts. Very short-term evaluations of FEC emission current stability were conducted at rather high facility background pressures of $10^{-5}$ to $10^{-6}$ Pa which is typical of electric propulsion test facilities. At these background pressures one would expect to have significant partial pressures of water, nitrogen, oxygen, carbon dioxide, hydrogen, and argon. Some of these gases may lead to changes in cathode surface chemistry and in field emission characteristics.[8] The quantification of vacuum facility atmospheric composition is left to future work. All cathodes were tested in a simple diode configuration.

**Apparatus and Procedure**

**Preparation of Cathode Materials**

As indicated in Table 1 there are three reference cathode materials namely, copper, pyrolytic graphite, and AISI O-1 low alloy tool steel. These three cathode materials have surface finishes in the range of 0.1 µm rms to 2.3 µm rms. Note that ground and polished surfaces have surface finishes of about 0.8 µm rms and 0.1 µm rms, respectively. Data from these materials serve as a baseline or reference. The materials of interest are CVD diamond, ion beam textured pyrolytic graphite, and ion beam textured copper. All substrates were washed in acetone and then ethyl alcohol prior to texturing or coating.

The diamond film on a molybdenum substrate was processed using hot-filament CVD. The 2.54 cm x 3.81 cm x 0.13 cm molybdenum substrate was placed at 800 °C. A gas mixture composed of 2% methane and 98% hydrogen was directed at a hot filament to stimulate the CVD process.[11,12] The diamond film thickness is approximately 4 µm.

Figure 1a is an illustration the apparatus used to texture the pyrolytic graphite (PG).[13] The PG naturally textures when sputtered by the ion beam. A 30 cm diameter argon ion source was used,[14] the PG was placed 15 cm downstream. The ion energy was 1000 eV, and the average ion current density at the ion source was 2.2 mA/cm$^2$. Ion etch time was 2 hours 11 minutes. The resulting surface structures are spires with heights of about 10 µm separated by about 4 µm. Figure 2a is a photomicrograph of typical texture on the ion beam processed PG. The textured surface appears black versus the gray color of the original PG.

Figure 1b shows the seed texturing process[13] used for the two textured copper coupons. A tantalum target was located at 45 degrees with respect to the 30 cm diameter ion source centerline as shown in Figure 1b. For the Textured Copper-C coupon, a 15 cm by 15 cm target was translated so the downstream edge was 20 cm below the centerline and 15 cm from the ion source. The copper coupon was located on centerline and 15 cm from the ion source. The argon ion energy was 1000 eV, and the average ion current density at the ion source was 2.1 mA/cm$^2$. The ion sputtering time in this case was 16 hours. Only wide-angle ions struck the tantalum seed target, so the tantalum arrival rate at the copper coupon was very low. The low seed arrival rate at the coupon and the operating conditions produced cones, on the copper surface, with diameters of about 12 µm and cone-heights of about 17 µm. Figure 2b is a photomicrograph of typical texture on the Textured Copper-C coupon. The color of this coupon is dark orange.
For the Textured Copper-S coupon, the target was translated so the downstream edge was about 7 cm below the centerline and 15 cm from the ion source. The copper coupon was located on centerline and 15 cm from the ion source. The argon ion energy was 1000 eV, and the average ion current density at the ion source was 3.1 mA/cm². The ion sputtering time in this case was 15 minutes. The tantalum arrival rate at the copper coupon was relatively high compared to the Textured Copper-C coupon. The high seed arrival rate at the coupon and the operating conditions produced closely packed spire-like structures on the copper surface with diameters estimated to be 1 µm or less.

The color of the Textured Copper-S coupon was black.

Configuration of the Electrodes
Field emission measurements were made in a simple diode configuration consisting of a stack comprised of a steel cathode base, a coupon at cathode potential, a polyimide spacer(s), and a steel anode. The stack was held in place using an insulated clamp. The steel anode was 2.54 cm x 3.81 cm x 0.32 cm, and the steel cathode base was made longer (2.54 cm x 6.35 cm x 0.32 cm) for handling purposes. Ground steel was selected for the electrode material because it had a reasonably smooth surface finish. The areas of the cathode coupons are identified in Table 1. The polyimide spacers were approximately 120 µm thick and were used to insulate the anode from the coupon/cathode electrode. The steel electrodes were drilled and tapped for terminating wires for the electrical circuit.

Test Facility and Instrumentation
Cathode tests were performed in a cryogenically-pumped bell jar with an ultimate pressure of 4 x 10⁻⁶ Pa. The cathode/anode assembly was mounted in a 0.3 m diameter test port attached to the bell jar. A 0.3 m pneumatic gate valve provided isolation of the bell jar and the test port during equipment changes. With the gate valve open, the test port/bell jar system pressure was usually less than 5 x 10⁻⁵ Pa.

Power to the diode arrangement was provided by a 5 kV, 25 W power supply. A current limiting resistor of 100 kΩ was also in the electrical circuit. Current monitoring was made using an electrometer capable of measuring to tens of picoamperes.

Results and Discussion

The Fowler-Nordheim Relation
Field emission is described as electrons tunneling through a potential barrier at the surface of a solid when a large electric field is applied. Knowing some of the surface properties, one can calculate the probability of an energetic electron tunneling through the potential barrier.[15] The electron field emission can be expressed by the Fowler-Nordheim (F-N) equation. For a given electrode separation and material work function, the following equation results for the current density.

\[ J = aV^2 \exp \left( -\frac{b}{V} \right) \]  \hspace{1cm} (1)

where \( V \) is the applied voltage and \( a, b \) are constants.

In Figure 3 the CVD diamond and Textured Copper-C data are plotted in the Fowler-Nordheim coordinates. The linearity of the plots indicate the data satisfy the F-N field emission relation.

Comparison of Field Emission Data
Figure 4 displays the field emission characteristics of the seven cathode materials. The reference materials copper, pyrolytic graphite, and steel had emission current densities of 30 µA/cm² or less. The textured pyrolytic graphite cathode had a current density of 84 µA/cm² and was stable over its first few hours of operation at 4 x 10⁻⁵ Pa background pressure. The textured pyrolytic graphite cathode was the most stable of all cathodes at the beginning-of-life. Extended operation of the cathodes was beyond the scope of this work. The CVD diamond and Textured Copper-C cathodes had maximum current densities of about 270 µA/cm² and 380 µA/cm², respectively. Both cathodes exhibited degradation of emission current during the first few hours of operation. The Textured Copper-S cathode current density was in the 0.9 to 2.3 µA/cm² range. These values are much lower than the untextured copper cathode current density. Reasons for this result are unknown to the author and await more detailed scanning electron microscope and energy dispersive X-ray analysis of this cathode material.

Figures 5 shows the CVD diamond cathode emission current versus applied voltage. There was a 75% reduction in emission current after operation at \( \sim 10^{-4} \)
Pa for about 4 hours. If the turn-on electric field is defined to be the applied field required to yield an emission current of 1 nA, then the turn-on electric field at beginning-of-life was 2.1 V/µm and four hours later it was 6.2 V/µm. Both of these results indicate there were significant changes in surface chemistry and/or surface structure.

Other investigators have had results that exhibited more stable emission currents when CVD diamond cathodes are operated at pressures in the $10^{-5}$ Pa to $10^{-6}$ Pa range.[12] In this example, a CVD diamond cathode operated for one hour with current fluctuations of 5% at the average current density of 330 µA/cm². The applied field was 18 V/µm. Total operating time was omitted.

Cathode emission current versus applied voltage for the Textured Copper-C cathode is shown in Figure 6. After one hour of testing, the emission current degraded by 30% to 40% for applied fields in the 7.6 V/µm to 8.0 V/µm range. The turn-on electric field was in the 3.2 V/µm to 3.4 V/µm range at beginning-of-life and one hour later. Extended tests need to be performed on this cathode to determine if the current degradation at higher electric fields is a burn-in effect or whether it is part of a long-term degradation process at background pressures of about $5 \times 10^{-5}$ Pa.

**Large Area Field Emitter Performance Comparisons**

Table 2 compares the performance of a few large area, molybdenum and carbon-based FECs.[7,16-19] Some of the vacuum processed diamond and carbon nanotube FECs have demonstrated current densities ≥ 90 mA/cm² at applied fields 5.5 V/µm to 11 V/µm. Molybdenum tipped FECs have also operated at tens of mA/cm². To the best of the author’s knowledge these FECs have not demonstrated stable, long-term operation in facilities with background pressures in the $10^{-2}$ Pa to $10^{-5}$ Pa range where water, oxygen, and nitrogen are present.

At lower current densities, carbon nanotubes[18] and laser-ablation processed diamond[19] have demonstrated stable emission at facility pressures of $10^{-4}$ Pa to $10^{-3}$ Pa for periods up to 25 hours. FECs run at low power stress or derated conditions have exhibited more stable emission.[20] In this case a carbon nanotube FEC was stable for one hour when a 13 V/µm field was applied. When the applied field was increased to 37 V/µm, the power stresses were sufficiently high to cause the emission current to degrade to nearly 10% of its initial value within one hour.

The CVD diamond FEC suffered a degradation in emission current of about 25% in a one-hour test independent of whether it was run at an applied field of 17 V/µm or 10 V/µm. For this CVD diamond FEC, derating performance is an inadequate solution for operation above $10^{-5}$ Pa. The Textured Copper-C also had emission current degradation of 30% to 40% after only one hour of testing at ~ 8 V/µm and a background pressure of 5 X $10^{-6}$ Pa. The textured pyrolytic graphite cathode had a current density of 84 µA/cm² and was the most stable of all cathodes at the beginning-of-life. The textured PG cathode emission current remained within ±7% of its average value for its first 1.5 hours of operation at a background pressure of 4 x $10^{-5}$ Pa and an applied field of 8V/µm. Extended testing of this material, although it has a modest field emission current density, appears warranted.

**Another Cathode Option: Ferroelectric Emission Cathodes**

A program to study ferroelectric emission (FEE) cathodes has recently been initiated at the NASA Glenn Research Center as an alternative expellantless cathode. Ferroelectrics are ceramics with a spontaneous electric polarization. Ferroelectric emission refers to the pulsed emission of electrons from ferroelectric ceramic materials.[21] If a large, fast rise-time, pulsed electric field is applied across a ferroelectric ceramic such that it opposes the spontaneous polarization, the ceramic will emit electrons. The electric field is generated by applying a high voltage pulse between a solid electrode on one side of the ferroelectric and a gridded electrode on the opposite, electron-emitting side. Electron emission of up to 100’s of A/cm² over a pulse length of hundreds of nanoseconds has been observed.[21]

FEE cathodes are being considered for reasons of simplicity and durability. The cathodes are capable of operating in background pressures up to 10 Pa and in impure environments. FEE cathodes have been run at 100 to 200 Hz for 10⁸ shots (approximately 2 hours).[22] Cathodes run in gun geometries reportedly
show little evidence of cathode damage and longer lives.[23] Since it has been reported that the cathodes can run with low, or no, electron extraction voltages, the concept appears to mitigate ion sputtering limiting mechanisms of FECs. Since FEE cathodes are cold cathodes, they should not be subject to the limitations physical evaporation places on thermionic cathodes. A ferroelectric emission cathode system is expected to be simple and compact. The cathode itself is essentially a capacitor, and thus is easily fabricated.

Electron current has been extracted from ferroelectrics in initial experiments at NASA GRC. Figure 7 shows a simple schematic of the FEE cathode assembly. The anode to grid separation distance was about 2 mm, the ferroelectric ceramic thickness was 1 mm, and the diameter was 2 cm. The ferroelectric tested was lead zirconate titanate (PZT). Rectangular, unipolar, high-voltage pulses of approximately -830 V to -930 V were applied to the rear of the ceramic. Current was collected at the anode with anode voltage of 50 to 100 V. From Figure 8, the cathode was capable of emitting approximately 100 mA to 400 mA peak currents for a pulse duration of approximately 500 ns. This corresponds to peak current densities of 30 mA/cm$^2$ to 120 mA/cm$^2$. Facility pressure was $4 \times 10^{-5}$ Pa. The high-voltage pulse threshold for electron emission was found to be approximately –700 V. Given the preliminary nature of the results presented here, it is anticipated that larger current densities at higher repetition rates can be realized, yielding high average current.

**Concluding Remarks**

Preliminary screening tests of field emission cathodes such as CVD diamond, textured pyrolytic graphite, and textured copper were conducted at background pressures typical of electric thruster test facilities to assess cathode performance and stability. At these background pressures one would expect to have significant partial pressures of water, oxygen, nitrogen and carbon dioxide. These gases may lead to changes in cathode surface chemistry and in the field emission characteristics.

From current voltage characteristics, it was found that the CVD diamond and textured metals cathodes clearly satisfied the Fowler-Nordheim emission relation. The CVD diamond and Textured Copper-C cathode had average current densities of 270 µA/cm$^2$ and 380 µA/cm$^2$, respectively, at the beginning-of-life. After a few hours of operation the CVD diamond and textured copper cathode emission currents degraded by 75% and 40%, respectively, at background pressures in the $10^{-5}$ Pa to $10^{-4}$ Pa range. The textured pyrolytic graphite had a moderate current density at beginning-of-life of 84 µA/cm$^2$, but this cathode was the most stable of all. Its emission current variation was ±7% about the average current for the first 1.5 hours of operation at $4 \times 10^{-5}$ Pa and an applied field of 8 V/µm. Extended testing of the most promising cathodes is warranted to determine if current degradation is a burn-in effect or whether it is a long-term degradation process due to the relatively high facility background pressures. Quantification of vacuum facility atmospheric composition is also left to future work.

Preliminary experiments with ferroelectric emission cathodes, which are ceramics with spontaneous electric polarization, have been conducted. Peak current densities of 30 mA/cm$^2$ to 120 mA/cm$^2$ have been obtained for a pulse duration of about 500 ns in the $10^{-4}$ Pa pressure range. Future work with the FEE cathodes will examine additional materials and high repetition rates which will likely lead to higher current levels.

**Acknowledgements**

The authors wish to acknowledge the assistance and technical support provided by Patrick P. Barber in the operation and setup of the vacuum facility. The authors also wish to acknowledge GENVAC Aerospace Corporation for supplying the CVD diamond coupons.

**References**


Table 1. Field emission cathode characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cathode identification</th>
<th>Cathode area, cm²</th>
<th>Surface preparation other than chemical cleaning</th>
<th>Surface characteristics</th>
<th>Cathode to anode separation, µm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Steel</td>
<td>1.0 to 2.2</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>0.1-0.7 µm rms surface finish</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pyrolytic graphite</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>2.3 µm rms surface finish</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textured pyrolytic graphite</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>Ion beam etched</td>
<td>Spires with heights of 6-12 µm and spacings of 3-6 µm</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVD diamond</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>Hot filament CVD, 2% CH₄, 98% H₂, 800 °C substrate</td>
<td>3 µm-5 µm coating on molybdenum</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copper</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>1.4 µm rms surface finish</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textured Copper-S</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Ion beam textured using tantalum “seed material”</td>
<td>Submicron diameter spires</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textured Copper-C</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Ion beam textured using tantalum “seed material”</td>
<td>Cones with bases of 10-15 µm and heights of 15-20 µm</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Large area field emitter performance comparisons.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Emitter area, cm²</th>
<th>Applied field, V/µm</th>
<th>Emission current density, mA/cm²</th>
<th>Stable operation demonstrated at 10⁻² to 10⁻⁵ Pa?</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Molybdenum tips</td>
<td>0.0078</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vacuum-processed diamond</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbon nanotubes</td>
<td>0.02 to 0.08</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbon nanotubes</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>Yes, at 7 x 10⁻³ Pa</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boron nitride - diamond</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>Yes, up to 2 x 10⁻³ Pa</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVD diamond</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.07 to 0.27</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>This paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textured Copper-C</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.23 to 0.39</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>This paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textured pyrolytic graphite</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.07 to 0.08</td>
<td>Yes, at 4 x 10⁻³ Pa (short term test)</td>
<td>This paper</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1a – Illustration of natural texturing of a target by an ion beam as was done with the textured pyrolytic graphite.
Figure 1b – Illustration of texturing of the copper coupons using “tantalum seed texturing”.

Figure 2a – Typical surface structure of the ion beam textured pyrolytic graphite. The structure is composed of sharp spires with heights and spacings of 6 µm to 12 µm and 3 µm to 6 µm, respectively.
Figure 2b – Typical surface structure of the ion beam textured copper. The structure is composed of cones with heights and bases of 15 $\mu$m to 20 $\mu$m and 10 $\mu$m to 15 $\mu$m, respectively.

Figure 3 – CVD diamond and textured copper data plotted in Fowler-Nordheim coordinates.
Figure 4 – Field emission current density range for the cathode materials tested in a diode mode. Cross-hatching indicates the variation of current density over the first few hours of life.

Figure 5 – Current versus voltage for the CVD diamond cathode showing emission current degradation with time.
Figure 6 – Current versus voltage for the Textured Copper-C cathode showing emission current degradation with time.

Figure 7 - Schematic diagram of the ferroelectric emission cathode. The top surface of the ferroelectric ceramic is coated with a conducting grid; the bottom surface is coated with a solid conductor. The anode grid is biased +V anode. The anode and ferroelectric grids are separated by mica isolators.
Figure 8 - Initial results of ferroelectric cathode experiments. Electron emission currents measured at the anode for various levels of anode voltage and high-voltage-pulse amplitude.